

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**



FILED

11-19-07
04:59 PM

Order Instituting Rulemaking to establish the
California Institute for Climate Solutions

Rulemaking 07-09-008

**REPLY COMMENTS OF THE CALIFORNIA COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND
TECHNOLOGY (CCST) ON THE RULEMAKING TO CONSIDER ESTABLISHING
THE CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR CLIMATE SOLUTIONS**

Susan Hackwood
Executive Director

California Council on Science and
Technology
5005 La Mart Drive, Suite 105
Riverside, CA 92507
hackwood@ccst.us
www.ccst.us
(951) 682-8701

November 19, 2007

The California Council on Science and Technology (CCST) respectfully submits its reply to submitted comments on the establishment of the California Institute for Climate Solutions (CICS) that would involve a consortium of major research institutions in the state. Our comments focus on three areas: development and review of CICS' research roadmap; a biennial external review of CICS; and governance and management.

CCST is a nonpartisan, impartial, not-for-profit corporation established in 1988 by state legislation. Its mission is to provide expert advice to the state about science and technology related public policy issues. CCST is modeled in part on the National Academies' National Research Council, with whom it has developed a close working relationship. More than half of CCST's members and fellows are also members of the National Academies of Sciences and Engineering and Institute of Medicine, and several are Nobel Laureates. CCST's membership includes all of the major academic research institutions in the state, as well as the six largest federal laboratories housed here, and many industry sectors, such as aerospace, medicine/health/bioscience, systems infrastructure, communications and information technology, and energy. Half of CCST Council members are from industry and federal laboratories; half are from academic institutions. (See attached list of current Council members.)

Specific comments:

CICS Development of the Research Roadmap before Research Funding is Committed

As noted by many others in their opening comments, a great deal of climate research is currently underway in California that is funded by state, federal and industry sources. At the outset, CICS, as a consortium of research institutions, should conduct a full inventory of such research efforts including, but not limited to, focus of efforts, and sources, levels and periods of funding determining the priorities of the CICS. In order to integrate all of the relevant research, CCST recommends that CICS include in the roadmap planning a steering committee of representatives of the relevant agencies and extant programs (e.g

PIER) along with the research community from industry, academia and federal labs. This steering committee would ensure that the roadmap is developed with consideration of the inventory of existing basic and applied research programs, so that future research will be complementary and reinforce those other efforts. CCST recommends that this roadmap be subject to a timely independent review.

Independent Biennial Review

CCST suggests that a neutral, non-stakeholder entity be asked to create an independent review panel to assess progress of the CICS on a biennial basis. CCST could conduct this evaluation, which would include a review of the public value of research programs, program planning and management practices, state energy policies, administrative and organizational issues, research review processes, and advisory committee functions.

A precedent exists for such a review process. Public Resources Code Section 25620.9(a) directed that an Independent Review Panel (IRP) be established to conduct a comprehensive evaluation of the Public Interest Energy Research (PIER) program. The IRP for the PIER program was convened and the review was conducted by CCST. In its review, CCST examined PIER in the context of the state's energy policies, program planning and management practices, research review processes, administrative and organizational issues, and advisory committees' functions.

Governance and Management

To ensure that all of the state's intellectual talent is brought to bear on the challenging issues of climate change, CICS's governance and management structure should include high-level representation from all of the state's major research institutions – including those in industry and federal laboratories. CCST requests that it be asked by the state to nominate at least two members to serve on the Governing Board. These nominations would be in addition to the officials named by UC and the CPUC and would bring to the Governing Board nominees selected by a third party with no financial interests in the

outcome. As noted in comments submitted, CCST also believes that the governance structure should include agency representatives with an investment in related research areas.

We again commend the CPUC for taking this bold step. We offer our services to help create a climate solutions research program that reflects the full range of research and educational expertise the state has to offer. It is imperative that such a research program include rigorous program development that benefits from independent review by experts both within and outside of UC -- at the outset and biennially. We believe that CCST, an organization established to advise the state on critical issues of science and technology, should be engaged in this effort to help ensure that the program developed is consistent with the overall mission goals and that public investments will leverage the best possible outcomes.

Respectfully Submitted,

California Council on Science and Technology

By:



Lawrence Papay
Council Chair



Charles Kennel
Council Chair-elect



Susan Hackwood
Executive Director

CALIFORNIA COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

2007 COUNCIL MEMBERS

Lawrence T. Papay, *Council Chair, CEO and Principal, PQR, LLC*

Cornelius W. “Neal” Sullivan, *Vice-Chair, Professor of Biological Sciences, University of Southern California*

Francine Berman, *Director, San Diego Super Computer Center, University of California, San Diego*

Julian Betts, *Professor of Economics, University of California, San Diego*

Susan Bryant, *Vice Chancellor for Research, University of California, Irvine*

Alfonso Cárdenas, *Professor of Computer Science, University of California, Los Angeles*

Michael T. Clegg, *Donald Bren Professor of Biological Sciences, University of California, Irvine*

Lawrence B. Coleman, *Vice Provost for Research, University of California*

Peter Cowhey, *Dean, School of International Relations and Pacific Studies, University of California, San Diego*

Charles Elachi, *Director, Jet Propulsion Laboratory*

Jean-Louis Gassée, *General Partner, Allegis Capital*

Corey Goodman, *President and CEO, Renovis, Inc.*

Milton Gordon, *President, California State University, Fullerton*

M.R.C. Greenwood, *Professor of Nutrition & Internal Medicine, University of California, Davis*

Carlos Gutiérrez, *Professor of Chemistry, California State University, Los Angeles*

Susan Hackwood, *Executive Director, California Council on Science and Technology*

Alice Huang, *Senior Faculty Associate in Biology, California Institute of Technology*

G. Scott Hubbard, *Carl Sagan Chair for the Study of Life in the Universe, SETI Institute*

Miriam E. John, *Emeritus Vice President, Sandia National Laboratories, California*

Jude Laspa, *Deputy Chief Operating Officer, Bechtel Group, Inc.*

David W. Martin, Jr., M.D., *Chairman & CEO, AvidBiotics Corporation*

George H. Miller, *Director, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory*

Michael Nacht, *Dean and Professor of Public Policy, Goldman School of Public Policy, University of California, Berkeley*

Stephen D. Rockwood, *Executive Vice President, Science Applications International Corp.*

Jeffrey Rudolph, *President and CEO, California Science Center*

James L. Sweeney, *Professor of Management Science and Engineering, Stanford University*

Andrew Viterbi, *President, Viterbi Group, LLC*

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Consider establishing California Institute for Climate Solutions	Rulemaking 07-09-008
--	----------------------

VERIFICATION

I, Susan Hackwood, Executive Director of the California Council on Science and Technology (“CCST”), am authorized to make this verification on behalf of the CCST. The statements in the foregoing document are true to the best of my knowledge, except for those matters that are stated on information and belief, and as to those matters I believe them to be true.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed this 19th day of November, at Riverside, California.



Susan Hackwood
Executive Director
5005 La Mart Drive, Suite 105
Riverside, CA 92507
hackwood@ccst.us
www.ccst.us
(951) 682-8701

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

Order Instituting Rulemaking to establish the
California Institute for Climate Solutions

Rulemaking 07-09-008

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on November 19, 2007, I served on all parties on the service list for R.07-09-008, by email, true copies of the original of the following document which is attached hereto:

REPLY COMMENTS OF THE CALIFORNIA COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND
TECHNOLOGY (CCST) ON THE RULEMAKING TO CONSIDER ESTABLISHING
THE CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR CLIMATE SOLUTIONS

The e-mail addresses to which the document was sent are shown on an attachment.

Dated: November 19th, 2007 at Riverside, CA.



Susan Hackwood
Executive Director
5005 La Mart Drive, Suite 105
Riverside, CA 92507
hackwood@ccst.us
www.ccst.us
(951) 682-8701

Service List for R.07-09-008:

DONALD	GILLIGAN	donaldgilligan@comcast.net
CHRISTOPHER	HILEN	chilen@sppc.com
NORMAN A.	PEDERSEN	npedersen@hanmor.com
DR. RANDOLPH W.	HALL	rwhall@usc.edu
ELIZABETH L.	AMBOS	eambos@calstate.edu
PROF. DAVID	RUTLEDGE	dave.rutledge@caltech.edu
DANIEL W.	DOUGLASS	douglass@energyattorney.com
AMBER E.	DEAN	amber.dean@sce.com
CASE	ADMINISTRATION	Case.Admin@sce.com
HOWARD	GOLLAY	howard.gollay@sce.com
LAURA	GENAO	laura.genao@sce.com
SUSAN	HACKWOOD	hackwood@ccst.us
TAM	HUNT	thunt@cecmail.org
DEVRA	WANG	dwang@nrdc.org
EVELYN	KAHL	ek@a-klaw.com
BRIAN	CRAGG	bcragg@goodinmacbride.com
IRENE K.	MOOSEN	irene@igc.org
MICHAEL	ALCANTAR	mpa@a-klaw.com
CHRISTOPHER	WARNER	cjw5@pge.com
JAMES L.	SWEENEY	Jim.sweeney@stanford.edu
ANN M.	ARVIN, MD	aarvin@stanford.edu
LARRY	HORTON	lhorton@stanford.edu
ALEXIS K.	WODTKE	lex@consumercal.org
PETER W.	HANSCHEN	phansch@mofo.com
LLOYD C.	LEE	lloyd.lee@ucop.edu
SAMUEL S.	KANG	samuelk@greenlining.org
THALIA N.C.	GONZALEZ	thaliag@greenlining.org
EDWARD	VINE	elvine@lbl.gov
FRANK	TENG	fteng@svlg.net
AUDRA	HARTMANN	Audra.Hartmann@Dynergy.com
VIRGIL	WELCH	vwelch@environmentaldefense.org
RONALD	LIEBERT	rliibert@cfbf.com
RYAN L.	FLYNN	Ryan.Flynn@pacificorp.com
CYNTHIA A.	FONNER	Cynthia.A.Fonner@constellation.com
GARY	HINNERS	ghinners@reliant.com
GARY A.	HINNERS	ghinners@reliant.com
BRIAN	MCQUOWN	bmcquown@reliant.com
ELENA	MELLO	emello@sppc.com
LEILANI JOHNSON	KOWAL	Leilani.johnson@ladwp.com
ROBERT L.	PETTINATO	robert.pettinato@ladwp.com
DEAN A.	KINPORTS	dakinports@semprautilities.com
RASHA	PRINCE	rprince@semprautilities.com
ALANA	STEELE	asteeler@hanmor.com
DR. MARK ALLEN	BERNSTEIN	mabernst@usc.edu
ERIC	KLINKNER	eklinkner@ci.pasadena.ca.us
REN	ZHANG	rzhang@cityofpasadena.net
STEVE	ENDO	sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us
HALL P.	DAILY	hdaily@caltech.edu
STEVEN G.	LINS	slins@ci.glendale.ca.us

BRUNO
RICHARD J.
DON
YVONNE
KIM
DESPINA
JEFFREY M.
MICHAEL E.
GEORGE
STEVEN
AUDREY
KAREN
LEAH
NORA
SHERYL
STEVE
SUSAN H.
VALERIE
WILLIAM H.
ANNE W.
JANINE L.
JOSEPH F.
MARTIN A.
ANDREW L.
BIANCA
ED
KATE
MEREDITH
SEBASTIAN
ELLEN R.
JODY S.

CLIFF
JESSE W.
ROBERT
MARCIA W.
KAREN
LYNN
C. SUSIE
JAMES
ANDREW
SUSAN L.
BRUCE
CATHY
CHANGUS
DOUGLAS K.
EDWARD
JANE E.
JEFFREY D.
VERONICA

JEIDER
MORILLO
LIDDELL
GROSS
KIENER
NIEHAUS
GARBER
CAMPBELL
DEHART
SCIORTINO
CHANG
TERRANOVA
FLETCHER
SHERIFF
CARTER
MCCOY-THOMPSON
MAC CORMAC
WINN
CHEN
KUYKENDALL
SCANCARELLI
WIEDMAN
MATTES
HARRIS
BOWMAN
LUCHA
BEARDSLEY
ALLEN
CSAPO
AURITI
LONDON

CHEN
RASKIN
GNAIZDA
BECK
NOTSUND
ALEXANDER
BERLIN
WEIL
BROWN
FISCHER, PH.D.
MCLAUGHLIN
REHEIS-BOYD
JONATHAN
KERNER
RANDOLPH
LUCKHARDT
HARRIS
VILLALOBOS

bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us
rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us
liddell@energyattorney.com
ygross@sempraglobal.com
kmkiener@cox.net
dniehaus@semprautilities.com
jmgarber@iid.com
mcampbell@iid.com
gdehart@anaheim.net
ssciortino@anaheim.net
achang@nrdc.org
filings@a-klaw.com
lfletcher@nrdc.org
nes@a-klaw.com
scarter@nrdc.org
smthomps@nexant.com
smaccormac@mofo.com
vjlw3@pge.com
bill.chen@constellation.com
AWK@flk.com
jscancarelli@flk.com
jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com
mmattes@nossaman.com
alho@pge.com
BRBC@pge.com
ELL5@pge.com
KEBD@pge.com
MEAE@pge.com
sscb@pge.com
Ellen.Auriti@ucop.edu
jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net
mrw@mrwassoc.com
cchen@ucsusa.org
jesser@greenlining.org
robertg@greenlining.org
mwbeck@lbl.gov
knotsund@berkeley.edu
lynn@lmaconsulting.com
sberlin@mccarthyllaw.com
jweil@aglet.org
abb@eslawfirm.com
sfischer@arb.ca.gov
mclaughlin@braunlegal.com
creheis@wspa.org
jonathan.changus@asm.ca.gov
dkk@eslawfirm.com
edward.randolph@asm.ca.gov
jluckhardt@downeybrand.com
jdh@eslawfirm.com
Vvillalo@usc.edu

WILLIAM W.
LYNN M.

WESTERFIELD III
HAUG

www@eslawfirm.com
lmh@eslawfirm.com